

SHEFFIELD CONSERVATION ADVISORY GROUP

Meeting held 19th March, 2013

| PRESENT: | <u>Name</u> | <u>Organisation</u> |
|----------|-----------------------------|--|
| | Dr. Philip Booth (Chair) | Co-opted Member |
| | Mr. Tim Hale (Deputy Chair) | Sheffield Chamber of Commerce |
| | Mrs Christine Ball | Civic Trust/South Yorkshire Industrial History Society |
| | Prof. Clyde Binfield | 20th Century Society |
| | Mr. Patrick Burns | Co-opted Member |
| | Mr. Howard Greaves | Hallamshire Historic Buildings Society |
| | Mr. Graham Hague | Victorian Society |
| | Dr. Roger Harper | Ancient Monuments Society |
| | Mr. Bob Hawkins | Council for the Protection of Rural England |
| | Mr. Stanley Jones | Hunter Archaeological Society |
| | Mr. Bob Marshall | Royal Town Planning Institute |
| | Mr. Andrew Shepherd | Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings |

.....

1. **COUNCILLOR JANICE SIDEBOTTOM**

The Chair (Dr. Booth) referred, in warm terms, to Councillor Janice Sidebottom who had represented the City Council on the Group for a number of years. The Group endorsed his sentiments and observed a minute's silence in memory of Councillor Sidebottom.

2. **APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Mr. Rod Flint (Georgian Group), Mr. Graham Hague (Victorian Society), Dr. Malcolm Tait (University of Sheffield), Mr. Philip Moore (Sheffield Society of Architects) and Dr. Alan Watson (Institution of Civil Engineers).

3 **MINUTES,**

The minutes of the meeting held on 22nd January, 2013 were approved as a correct record, subject to the substitution in the attendance, of the words "University of Sheffield" for the words "Institution of Civil Engineers" and the words "Institution of Civil Engineers" for the words "University of Sheffield"; and, arising therefrom, the Group (a) noted that:-

(i) in the opinion of Mr. Hale, the new artwork at the TESCO supermarket site, Spital Hill

was particularly attractive;

(ii) (A) the west and north ranges of Barnes Hall Farm had been listed and the existing description of the Farm had been amended to include the medieval origins of the Farm; and

(B) the Head of Planning would send copies of the enlarged description, to Members of the Group;

(iii) the scale of development at Westbrook House, Sharrow Vale Road had been reduced, with a smaller building and less car parking, the proposed staircase had been moved within the scheme, the glazing between the old building and the new building would be larger and the cladding material would be brick;

(iv) the scale of the scheme for development of the Old Bull's Head, Dun Street had been reduced and there was better detailing in the scheme which, with careful conditioning, should be acceptable; and

(b) the Group (i) while accepting the principle of change, restated its opposition to the scheme regarding Barnes Hall Farm, which it considered to be out of character with the listed buildings on the site and would have a damaging impact on them, (ii) expressed its disappointment that the developer did not accept, that relatively small amendments to the scheme were required to make it acceptable (iii) felt that the application should be dealt with by a conservation officer in accordance with planning legislation and (iv) requested the Chair (Dr. Booth) to write to the Head of Planning to draw his attention to this decision and convey the depth of feeling of the Group in connection with it.

4. **CHAIR'S REPORT**

The Chair reported that:-

(a) following the referral of the application regarding the former Jessop's Hospital's Edwardian Wing to the Secretary of State, it had been discovered that a number of Statutory Organisations had not been consulted regarding the application. They had then been consulted and the application had subsequently been re-approved by the City Centre South and East Planning Committee. It was possible that the application would be considered further at a public inquiry; and

(b) public consultations regarding the draft Stocksbridge Neighbourhood Plan would end on 22nd April next.

The Group (i) noted the information and (ii) stressed that it supported the aim of the University of Sheffield to provide a significant building and additional accommodation for its Engineering Department, but it considered that the scheme which had been considered by the Planning Committee was quite unacceptable.

5. **HEAD OF PLANNING'S REPORT**

The Head of Planning reported that (a) the City Council, on public safety grounds, had paid for the scaffolding surrounding the Haqqani House Mosque to remain in place and then for partial demolition of the building, the cost of which would be recouped by way of land charge; and

(b) (i) the Lower Matlock Waterwheel had been omitted, inadvertently, in the transfer of property between companies, so the Wheel itself was now in the ownership of the Crown and (ii) it was anticipated that funding for restoring the Wheel should be available from English Heritage.

The Group noted the information.

6. **SHEFFIELD SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT AND DESIGN PANEL**

The Group noted that the scheduled meeting of the Sheffield Sustainable Development and Design Panel on 14th March, 2013 had been cancelled and, subject to confirmation, its next meeting would be held on 18th April, 2013.

7. **HERITAGE ASSETS**

The Group considered the following applications for planning permission for development affecting Heritage Assets and made the observations stated:-

- (a) **Demolition of existing extension, alterations to office building (Class B1/A2) for educational use (Class D1), erection of associated two-storey side extension; rear decked area with undercroft including provision for air source heat pumps; and covered external teaching area with ancillary external spaces and formation of new opening in boundary wall fronting Clarke Drive to provide level access at Belmayne House 99 Clarkehouse Road.
(Case Number: 13/00470/FUL)**

The Group felt that there was no objection, in principle, to the development subject to the provision of glazing bars to the fenestration of the extension.

- (b) **Landscaping works including provision of footpath/cycle path link between Fitzwalter Road and Shrewsbury Road (Full application under Reg 3 1992) and demolition of retaining wall (Conservation Area Consent application under Reg 3 - 1992)
(Case Number: 13/00390/RG3 & 13/00391/RG3)**

The Group welcomed the proposal to enable access to both roads and felt that, in principle, there was no objection to the scheme subject to the use of more sympathetic materials, to the satisfaction of the Head of Planning.

- (c) **Erection of a mixed-use development incorporating educational Facilities and associated functions (Class B1/D1), 53 student cluster flats containing 287 bed spaces and facilities together with associated works including access and ancillary facilities (Phase 1); conversion and refurbishment of former St Luke's School Building, for office use (Phase 2) 29 - 65 Garden Street
(Case Number: 13/00576/FUL & 13/00577/CAC 13/00576/FUL & 13/00577/CAC)**

The Group felt that the scale and massing of the scheme was unacceptable and the development would be a monolithic block, which was clearly in breach of the principles established by the Urban Design Compendium and would obscure views down Rockingham Street.

- (d) **Erection of a two-storey dwellinghouse with rooftop terrace at 15 Napier Street (Case Number: 12/03892/FUL)**

The Group felt that there was, in principle, no objection to the scheme.

(NOTE: Mr. Shepherd declared an interest in this item, on the grounds that he had represented the nearby Baptist Church on a number of occasions).

8. MISCELLANEOUS ITEMS

Members of the Group reported on developments affecting Heritage Assets and Conservation Areas and the Group noted that:-

- (a) the Head of Planning would investigate and report back on condition of the roof of the Crookes Valley Methodist Church, Barber Road;
- (b) In the opinion of Dr. Harper, the Don Valley Stadium was a fine building, although it was probably not of listable quality and it would be a great pity, if it was lost; and
- (c) the Guardian newspaper had published a letter referring to the practice, in the past, of blocking up windows to avoid paying a window tax and suggesting that the proposed so-called "bedroom tax" could be avoided by blocking up internal doors;
- (d) (i) a new series of the television programme "The Planners" was in preparation. In the opinion of the Chair, it would be useful if the City Council's Planning Service, or the Group itself was the subject of one of the programmes and (ii) the Sheffield Live Channel would commence broadcasting television programmes next autumn;
- (e) the Old Hall Farm, Brightholmlee was for sale. Mr. Jones aimed to gain access, to carry out inspection of its interior, which largely dated from the 16th Century, with a medieval section and a parlour dating from 1690 and to report back. Scaffolding had been erected to support a gable which had been unsafe, thanks to the intervention of the Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings;
- (f) Mr Graham Hague had written a report on Knowle Hill Mill, Station Road, Mosborough and Mr. Greaves had applied for the building to be listed;
- (g) a number of windows had been removed from the former Blue Coats School, Psalter Lane. The re-roofing of the building was under way;
- (h) English Heritage had refused a further request from Mr. Greaves for the listing of Cow Mouth Farm, had recommended that it be considered for local listing and had confirmed that the listing description of 2009 accurately described the building. Local listing could be effective, depending on the resolve of the local authority involved;
- (i) in the opinion of Mr. Shepherd, the BBC4 Channel had recently broadcast an excellent television programme, on the growth of conservation law;

- (j) the Head of Planning was investigating reported activity at the former Jessop Hospital's Edwardian Wing and would investigate the condition of the paving on the periphery of Fargate, which had been lifted carelessly by various contractors;
- (k) English Heritage had been requested to consider listing Crosspool Manor. It was hoped that Moor View Farm would be retained; and
- (l) The Head of Planning would investigate the condition of Loxley Old Chapel and would consider whether urgent works should be carried out at the property.

(NOTE: The above minutes are subject to amendment at a future meeting)

This page is intentionally left blank